

Message Text

SECRET

PAGE 01 MOSCOW 15786 01 OF 02 171826Z

42

ACTION SS-25

INFO OCT-01 ISO-00 SSO-00 NSCE-00 CIAE-00 DODE-00 INRE-00

AECE-00 /026 W

----- 025629

O 171645Z OCT 74

FM AMEMBASSY MOSCOW

TO SECSTATE WASHDC IMMEDIATE 3555

S E C R E T SECTION 1 OF 2 MOSCOW 15786

EXDIS

E.O. 11652: XGDS-3

TAGS: US, UR, PARM, OEXD

SUBJECT: TTBT/PNE NEGOTIATIONS-SUMMARY OF OCT 17 PLENARY

PNE MESSAGE NUMBER TWENTY-THREE

1. MEETING BEGAN AT 4:10 P.M. BUCHHEIM, CHAIRMAN, READ

FOLLOWING STATEMENT: QUOTE:

GOOD AFTERNOON, MR. MINISTER.

TODAY, WE WOULD LIKE TO DISCUSS TWO RELATED ASPECTS OF THE VITAL TOPIC OF VERIFICATION WHICH WE BELIEVE SHOULD BE MORE FULLY EXPLORED IN SUBSEQUENT MEETINGS OF OUR DELEGATIONS.

WE MUST RAISE SOME QUESTIONS CONCERNING YOUR APPROACH TO VERIFYING THE PEACEFUL PURPOSES OF PNES, AND AT THE SAME TIME VERIFYING THAT NO WEAPONS-RELATED BENEFITS ARE TO BE PROVIDED BY PNES. AS WE UNDERSTAND YOUR EXPRESSED VIEW, VERIFICATION OF PNE ACTIVITIES UNDER ARTICLE III OF THE 1974 TEST BAN TREATY OF 1974 WOULD REST UPON NATIONAL TECHNICAL MEANS AUGMENTED FOR PNES WITH YIELDS GREATER THAN THE THRESHOLD BY THE EXCHANGE OF CERTAIN INFORMATION. THIS INFORMATION WOULD INCLUDE PURPOSE, PLACE, YIELD, AND TIME BEFORE A PNE SHOT AND ACTUAL YIELD AND RESULTS AFTER THE SHOT. IN ADDITION DR. SAFRONOV STATED IN HIS PRESENTATION THAT THE INFORMATION YOU WOULD PROVIDE ON THE PURPOSE OF THESE PNES WOULD BE SUFFICIENT FOR US TO CHARACTERIZE THE DEPTH OF THE

SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 02 MOSCOW 15786 01 OF 02 171826Z

EXPLOSION. IT WOULD BE HELPFUL IF YOU COULD PROVIDE

FURTHER DETAILS CONCERNING THE INFORMATION WHICH WOULD BE INCLUDED UNDER THE GERNERAL DESCRIPTION OF PURPOSE.

WE ALSO BELIEVE THAT AN IMPORTANT ELEMENT OF VERIFICATION WOULD BE THE INDEPENDENT CONFIRMATION BY THE OTHER PARTY OF THE PURPOSE OF THE EVENT. CLEARLY, ANY NUCLEAR EXPLOSION SHOULD TAKE PLACE AWAY FROM THE NUCLEAR TEST SITE ONLY IS IT SERVES AN ENTIRELY PEACEFUL PURPOSE. THIS IS ONE OF THE LIMITATIONS OF THE TTBT. WE WOULD LIKE TO ASK FOR AN EXPLALATION OF HOW YOUR APPROACH TO VERIFICATION COULD ENABLE THE OTHER PARTY TO MAKE AN INDEPENDENT CONFIRMATION OF THE PEACEFUL PURPOSE OF A PNE EVENT. NEXT, THERE IS THE RELATED CONCERN THAT THE EXPLOSION MIGHT SERVE A DUAL PURPOSE: TO CARRY OUT THE PEACEFUL FUNCTION AND, CONCURRENTLY, TO CARRY OUT A WEAPON TEST OR A WEAPON-REATED DEVELOPMENT. THE LATTER ACTIVITIES WOULD NOT BE CONSISTENT WITH THE OBLIGATIONS OF THE TTBE. WHAT VERIFICATION PROVISIONS WOULD PREVENT SUCH ACTIVITIES, OR WOULD LEAD TO THEIR DETECTION BY THE OTHER PARTY?

THAT CONCLUDES OUR PRESENATION FOR TODAY, MR. MINISTER. WE LOOK FORWARD TO HEARING THE VIEWS OF THE SOVEIT SIDE ON THESE MATTERS AND ON OTHER ASPECTS OF THE CRITERIA AND CONCERNS WHICH WE HAVE STATED AT AN EARLY TIME. END QUOTE.

2. MOROKHOV THEN STATED THAT HE HAD A PRESENTATON ON VEFIFICATION. MOROKHOV BEGAN HIS REMARKS BY STATING THAT IN THE COURSE OF THE DISCUSSION ON VERIFICATION, BOTH SIDES HAD APPARENTLY COME TO REALIZE THE NEED FOR WORKING OUT PARTAMETERS FOR AN EXCHANGE OF INFORMATION "NECESSARY AND SUFFICIENT" TO VERIFY BOTH BELOW THRESHOLD AND ABOE THRESHOLD PNES. HE CONTINUED THAT HE HAD CONCLUDED THAT US AGREED, IN PRINCIPLE, THAT THERE SHOULD BE NO LIMITATIONS ON THE SIZE AND NUMBERS OF PNES AND IF THAT WAS NOT THE CASE, ASKED THAT HE BE CORRECTED. HE CONTINUED BY STATING THAT VERIFICATION REQUIREMENTS COULD BE ACHIEVED BY ADVANCE NOTICE OF PURPOSE,

SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 03 MOSCOW 15786 01 OF 02 171826Z

TIME, LOCATION AND YIELD AND THE ACTUAL YIELD AND RESULTS AFTER THE EXPLOSION. HE REPEATED HIS POINT MADE IN THE FIFTH PLENARY SESSION THAT IF WE AGREE ON THE MATTER OF BROADER COOPERATION WE WILL BE ABLE TO AGREE ON EXPANDING SCOPE OF INFORATION TO BE EXCHANGED, EXPECIALLY THAT WHICH WILL SERVE TO INPLEMENT ARTICLE V OF THE NPT.

MATLOCK

SECRET

NNN

SECRET

PAGE 01 MOSCOW 15786 02 OF 02 171745Z

42

ACTION SS-25

INFO OCT-01 ISO-00 SSO-00 NSCE-00 CIAE-00 DODE-00 INRE-00

AECE-00 /026 W

----- 025144

O 171645Z OCT 74

FM AMEMBASSY MOSCOW

TO SECSTATE WASHDC IMMEDIATE 3556

S E C R E T SECTION 2 OF 2 MOSCOW 15786

EXDIS

3. BUCHHEIM STATED THAT HE WOULD MAKE SOME PRELIMINARY COMMENTS ON MOROKHOV'S STATEMENT AFTER MYASNIKOV'S PRESENTATION.

4. MYASNIKOV THEN READ A STATEMENT THAT ESSENTIALLY SAID THAT THE YIELD OF ANY PNE WAS DETERMINED BY THE PURPOSE OF THE EXPULSION. HE POINTED OUT THAT IF THE YIELD SHOULD BE HIGHER THAN ORGINALLY CALCULATED THAT THE CONSEQUENCES COULD BE SERIOUS. EXAMPLES OF DAMAGE WERE THAT IN THE CASE OF OIL OR GAS STORAGE CAVITIES ACQUIFERS MIGHT BE PENERTATED,ALLOWING CAVITY TO FILL WITH WATER; IN THE CASE OF STIMULATIONS, THE CAP ROCK MIGHT BE DAMAGED OR IN THE CASE OF EXCAVATIONS SEISMIC DAMAGE COULD RESULT OR RADIAION COULD BE SPREAD OUTSIDE OF THE "SAFETY ZONE." IF THE YIELD SHOULD BE LOWER THAN ORIGINALLY CALCULATED THAN THERE WOULD BE ADVERSE ECONOMIC EFFECTS ON THE PROJECT. THE IMPLICATION WAS THAT AN UNTESTED DEVICE WOULD NEVER BE USED FOR A PNE APPLICATION BECAUSE IT WOULD BE TOO COSTLY IN MONEY AND TIME IF THE YIELD WERE TOO LOW AND IN SAFETY IF THE YIELD WERE TOO HIGH.

5. MYASNIKOV'S STATEMENT WAS VERY POORLY TRANSLATED SO THAT A "VERBATIM" WILL BE DIFFICULT TO PREPARE. THIS IS THE SECOND TIME THE SAME TRASLATOR HAS MARRED A MYASNIKOV STATEMENT.

SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 02 MOSCOW 15786 02 OF 02 171745Z

5. MOROKHOV SUPPLEMENTED MYASNIKOV'S REMARKS AND SAID ONE OF THE FEATURES OF PNE WAS THE NEED FOR AN EXACT KNOWLEDGE OF THE YIELD OF THE DETONATION PRIOR TO USE. THE ACCURACY REQUIRED INCREASED WITH THE YIELD OF THE EXPLOSION. A DEVIATION OF THE ACTUAL YIELD FROM THE CALCULATED YIELD MAY RESULT IN MORE SERIOUS CONSEQUENCES WITH HIGHER YIELDS THAN LOWER YIELDS. THIS FACTOR MAKES A DIFFERENCE IN PRINCIPLE BETWEEN PNES AND NUCLEAR WEAPON TESTS. THIS IS AN IMPORTANT DISTINCTION FOR VERIFICATION.

7. BUCHHEIM MADE A PRELIMINARY EXTEMPORANEOUS COMMENT ON MOROKHOV'S STATEMENT. HE SAID THAT US DID NOT SHARE VIEW THAT THERE MUST BE NO LIMIT ON YIELD OR NUMBER OF PNES BUCHHEIM STATED THAT WE DID NOT AGREE, IN PRINCIPLE, WITH THIS VIEW AND FURTHER STATED THAT WE WERE PROCEEDING FROM THE PREMISE THAT WE WERE HERE TO SEEK A BASIS FOR AN AGREEMENT ON PNES THAT WOULD INCLUDE ADEQUATE VERIFICATION THAT TERMS OF EXISTING TREATIES LIMITING WEAPONS ACTIVITY ARE FULLY COMPLIED WITH, AND THAT THE INTEGRITY OF THESE TREATIES IS PRESERVED. HE ADDED THAT WE DO NOT SEEK TO PLACE POINTLESS IMPEDIMENTS IN THE WAY OF DEVELOPMENT OF TECHNOLOGY FOR PEACEFUL ECONOMIC PURPOSES. HOWEVER, IF THERE ARE INADEQUACIES IN VERIFICATION PROVISIONS, IN PRINCIPLE, COMPENSATING LIMITATIONS ON PNES MAY BE NECESSARY.

8. COMMENTING EXTEMPORANEOUSLY, MOROKHOV SAID THAT THE SOVIET SIDE HAD ALREADY CLEARLY STATED ITS POSITION THAT UNDER THE NPT, WHICH IS MORE RELEVANT THAN THE TTBT, THERE SHOULD BE NO LIMIT ON PNES. THE SOVIET POSITION, BASED ON THIS CONSIDERATION, IS ONE OF PRINCIPLE. HE STATED THAT WE HAVE HEARD THAT THE US POSITION INVOLVED SOME LIMITATIONS AND NOW REQUESTS A CLEARER STATEMENT OF YOUR VIEWS ON VERIFICATION. OTHERWISE THE SIDES MAY BE TOO FAR APART AND FURTHER NEGOTIATIONS MIGHT BE USELESS. MOROKHOV THEN RETREATED SOMEWHAT, STATING, "IN SUMMARY," THAT THE SIDES MUST FIND AGREEMENT UNDER
SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 03 MOSCOW 15786 02 OF 02 171745Z

ARTICLE III OF THE TTBT, AND TOWARD THAT END, A

CLEAR-CUT STATEMENT OF THE US POSITION IS NECESSARY.

9. BUCHHEIM REPEATED THAT WE OPPOSED IN PRINCIPLE
THAT STATEMENT THAT PNES MUST HAVE NO YIELD OR NUMBER
LIMIT. WE HAVE PROPOSED NO PNE LIMITATION IN THESE
NEGOTIATIONS. SUCH LIMITS, IF ANY, WOULD DEPEND
ON THE ADEQUACY OF VERIFICATION PROCEDURES. WE
WILL CONTINUE TO WORK WITH YOU.

10. MOROKHOV THEN SAID "I AM SATISFIED."

11. MEETING ENDED AT 1715 HOURS.
STOESSEL

SECRET

NNN

Message Attributes

Automatic Decaptioning: Z
Capture Date: 01 JAN 1994
Channel Indicators: n/a
Current Classification: UNCLASSIFIED
Concepts: PEACEFUL NUCLEAR EXPLOSIONS, MEETING REPORTS, NEGOTIATIONS
Control Number: n/a
Copy: SINGLE
Draft Date: 17 OCT 1974
Decaption Date: 28 MAY 2004
Decaption Note: 25 YEAR REVIEW
Disposition Action: RELEASED
Disposition Approved on Date:
Disposition Authority: shawdg
Disposition Case Number: n/a
Disposition Comment: 25 YEAR REVIEW
Disposition Date: 28 MAY 2004
Disposition Event:
Disposition History: n/a
Disposition Reason:
Disposition Remarks:
Document Number: 1974MOSCOW15786
Document Source: CORE
Document Unique ID: 00
Drafter: n/a
Enclosure: n/a
Executive Order: X3
Errors: N/A
Film Number: D740296-0100
From: MOSCOW
Handling Restrictions: n/a
Image Path:
ISecure: 1
Legacy Key: link1974/newtext/t19741039/aaaabhgh.tel
Line Count: 236
Locator: TEXT ON-LINE, ON MICROFILM
Office: ACTION SS
Original Classification: SECRET
Original Handling Restrictions: EXDIS
Original Previous Classification: n/a
Original Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Page Count: 5
Previous Channel Indicators:
Previous Classification: SECRET
Previous Handling Restrictions: EXDIS
Reference: n/a
Review Action: RELEASED, APPROVED
Review Authority: shawdg
Review Comment: n/a
Review Content Flags:
Review Date: 18 APR 2002
Review Event:
Review Exemptions: n/a
Review History: RELEASED <18 APR 2002 by garlanwa>; APPROVED <19 MAR 2003 by shawdg>
Review Markings:

Declassified/Released
US Department of State
EO Systematic Review
30 JUN 2005

Review Media Identifier:
Review Referrals: n/a
Review Release Date: n/a
Review Release Event: n/a
Review Transfer Date:
Review Withdrawn Fields: n/a
Secure: OPEN
Status: NATIVE
Subject: TTBT/PNE NEGOTIATIONS-SUMMARY OF OCT 17 PLENARY PNE MESSAGE NUMBER TWENTY-THREE
TAGS: PARM, US, UR
To: STATE
Type: TE
Markings: Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 30 JUN 2005